

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,  
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEMS  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL NO. 2327

---

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO THE CASE(S)  
ON THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT(S)

**ORDER**  
(Dismissing Ethicon Defendants without Prejudice)

Pending in MDL 2327, 2:12-md-2327 [ECF No. 8181] is a Joint Motion to Dismiss without Prejudice filed by plaintiff(s), identified in Exhibit(s) A, and Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, and/or Ethicon, LLC (collectively referred to as "Ethicon"). The Motion seeks an order granting dismissal of the Ethicon defendants without prejudice.

The court **ORDERS** that:

- (1) the Joint Motion to Dismiss without Prejudice is **GRANTED**; and
- (2) the Ethicon defendants are **DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE** from the action(s) listed on the attached Exhibit(s) A;
- (3) if there are no remaining defendants in a civil action, then (a) that civil action is dismissed and stricken from the docket and (b) any pending motions are **DENIED** as moot.

The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to:

- (1) dismiss the Ethicon defendants from the individual civil action(s) without prejudice;

- (2) if no other defendants remain in an individual action, then (a) strike the action from the docket, and (b) close the case;
- (3) file a copy of this Order in MDL 2327 and in each individual case on the attached Exhibit(s); and,
- (4) send a copy of this Order to counsel of record and any unrepresented party.

ENTER: May 22, 2019



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Joseph R. Goodwin". Below the signature, there is a horizontal line. Underneath the line, the name "JOSEPH R. GOODWIN" is printed in a black serif font, followed by "UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE" in a smaller black serif font.

## EXHIBIT A

Civil Action No.	Case Style
2:12cv02852	Marie Morris v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv02947	Charlotte Ann Schaub v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv02951	Brenda J. Wooden and Barry Wooden v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv03163	Geraldean Gaylor v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv03251	Iva June Tharp v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv03258	Deborah Jean Mullins v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv03268	Janice Gregory and John Gregory v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv05790	TeresaL. Phelps v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv06875	Ruth Lucille Sandy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv08522	Patricia Bristol v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv09853	Stephanie Cunningham and Harvey Cunningham v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv09856	Elizabeth Brock and Anthony Brock v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:12cv09857	Patricia Moore Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv00142	Beth McKitterick v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv01703	Jerene Maxwell and Eh Maxwell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv01965	Dawn Maestas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv03243	Carolyn Johnson and Tony Johnson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv06746	Chrissy Haubrick v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv09321	Helen Boyd v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10226	Jami L. Ballard and Rodney Ballard v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10240	Natalie Horton and Daniel Horton v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10253	Susan Rosemary Fisher and Michael Fisher v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10319	Betty A. James and Joseph James v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10474	Laura Eve Silverberg v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10756	Paula Bowman and Jeffrey Bowman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10757	Judy Bradley and Brad Bradley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10761	<del>Regina Kay Carey and James Carey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson &amp; Johnson</del>
2:13cv10762	Kimbel Diane Clarkson and Gary Clarkson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10763	Bhavna M. Brahmbhatt and Mahesh Brahmbhatt v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10871	Robyn McDowell and Fredrick McDowell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10872	Dottie Moltrum and Ray Moltrum v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson

2:13cv10873	Tammy L. Parker and Charles Parker v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv10875	Diane H. Strong and Cyrus Strong v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv11567	Angela Rose Brown v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv11598	Lorna Darling and Jonathan Darling v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24571	Christie Freeman and James Freeman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24583	Rachel Alamillo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24602	Collean Dennis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24640	Dona Ray Dennis-Brooks and James Brooks v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24641	Cynthia Domingos and Ron Domingos v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24643	Antionette Garnica v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24645	Lori Dvorak and Paul Dvorak v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24650	Teresa Garza and Rene Garza v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24974	Kathy Kellogg v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24981	Hallie Schmidt Ketchum and James Ketchum v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24990	Julie LaFlamme and John LaFlamme v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv24996	Denice Large and Robert Large v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25025	Mary Robinson and Terry Robinson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25028	Honey Schiller and Michael Schiller v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25036	Eileen Speer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25945	Emma Lee Watkins v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25952	Kimberly Cicciarelli v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv25984	Josefina Valenzuela and Gerardo Valenzuela v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26009	Cindy Dukes and Paul Dukes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26425	Margie Gibson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26429	Heather Jones v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26451	Sandra Kolosci v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26487	Angela Lambeth and David Lambeth v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26492	Donna Magana and Michael Magana v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26523	Nita Martin and George Martin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv26536	Christy R. Olson and Terry Olson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv27327	Debra Segovia and Gabriel Segovia, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv27371	Michelle Paul and Chad Paul v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv27401	Carole Schmitz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv27406	Judy Smith and James Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv27429	Barbara Tackitt and Harvey Tackitt, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson

2:13cv27436	Melanie Towle and James Patrick Towle v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28115	Clova Watt and Jerry Watt, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28117	Laura Wolfe and John Wolfe v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28141	Connie Hite v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28144	Sandy L. Raley and Larry Raley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28146	Joyce Brown and Charles Cannon v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28161	DyAnne L. Barksdale and Michael H. Barksdale v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28163	Bonnie Seratt v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28168	Dolly Lozano and Jesus Lozano v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28455	Pamela Jones and Gary Hall v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28908	Denise Bradley and Julius Shelby v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28915	Irene Davila and Jesse Davila v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv28925	Joyce Davis and Raymond Davis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv29549	Elizabeth Furner and Lee Furner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv29555	Norma Garcia v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv29659	Francisca Hernandez and Julio Izaguirre v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv31372	Shacarie Vargas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv31450	Martina D. Ortiz and David Ortiz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv31487	Dora Ramirez and Robert Ramirez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv31507	Elizabeth Munoz and Joe G. Munoz, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv31765	Irma Mendiola and Roger Mendiola v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv32011	Teresa Simonsen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv32029	Ester S. Trejo and Norberto Trejo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv32046	Willie Pearl Willis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv32125	Dorothy J. Rushing v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:13cv32129	Tamara Eckes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv02315	April Weyer and Robert Weyer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv02329	Patricia Marshall v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv02364	Donna Utterback v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv02838	Priscilla O'Fiel v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv04453	Olga Ibarra and Cesar Ibarra v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv04844	Lynn Scott and Gregory Scott v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv04850	Henrietta Coronado and Arturo Lagos v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv04901	Constance Sherer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson

2:14cv04948	Carol Belge v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv05030	Gyna Soto Santana and George Santana v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv08044	Tally Matthews and Timothy Matthews v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv10405	Martha Bowden v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv10416	Marilyn Cavanaugh v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv11567	Kathryn Devun and John Devun v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv11956	Audrey Lane v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv11962	Debra Ledet v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv14517	Lorraine Harding and John Harding v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17432	Cathleen Terry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17441	Patsy Scott and Donnie Scott v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17457	Christina Bridger v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17464	Branda Dill and Richard Dill, II v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17469	Deborah Evans v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17625	Massiel Cavallo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17627	Charlene Coleman and Donald Coleman, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17630	Della Gilstrap and Johnny Gilstrap, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17634	Laura Keenan v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17635	Kathleen Phillips v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17664	Bette Jo DeVito and John DeVito, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv17665	Angelina Duke v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv18556	Barbara Shetterly v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv18558	Shelley Parker and Bret Noah v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv18559	Barbara Boggs and Ronald Boggs v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv18561	Susan Hough v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv18576	Patricia Massey and Jovey Massey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19535	Cynthia Bennett and Gary Bennett v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19555	Lorraine Deering and Jacob Deering v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19568	Annita Fulton and Jerry Fulton v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19930	Mary Ann Simpson and Merrill Simpson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19936	Geri Drury v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv19941	Elizabeth Gutierrez and Phillip Gutierrez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20037	Barbara Searby and Steve Searby v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20187	Grace Bennett and Carolynn Luttrell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20193	Rhonda Moore and Dennis Moore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20234	Sylvia Temple and Charles Temple v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20300	Omega Blankenship v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20385	Sandra Jackson and Rudolph Jackson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20756	Darlene M. Wing v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20760	Kelley Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20763	Gail Coulombe and Michael Coulombe v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv20768	Molly Mettling v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21208	Katharine Davidson and Richard Davidson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21209	Kathy K. Wood and Christopher D. Wood v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson

2:14cv21222	Fay McCurdy and Bruce McCurdy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21235	Elizabeth Gardner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21256	Connie Parsley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21300	Susan Stewart and Randy Stewart v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21307	Aja Malone Ryals and Frank Ryals v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21385	Jennifer Ard v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21438	Kimberly Nightingale and Terry Nightingale v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21522	Deborah Schroeder and Ted Schroeder v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv21629	Janet Allen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv22420	Melissa R. Murphy and Timothy J. Henry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv22466	Rosemary Pitra v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv22549	Jeanette Payne and Joseph Payne v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv26694	Angela M. Judge and Michael D. Judge, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27894	Maureen Farmer and Phillip A. Farmer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27897	Mira Gurevich and Boris Gurevich v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27907	Jean D. Hickey and John P. Hickey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27908	Sandra Myers and Frederick Myers v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27915	Eunice NaQuin and Steve NaQuin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27918	Pamela Rodriguez and Martin Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27921	Donna Cataldo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27922	Gretchen V. Caines and Cameron F. Caines v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27957	Teresa Kirchner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27958	Barbara Eady and Richard Eady v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27959	Christina M. Verry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27960	Geraldine Knapp and Richard Knapp v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv27961	Jennifer Stam and Yancey Stam v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28739	Judith G. Sanders v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28740	Lucy Smith and Ivory Smith, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28745	Wilma Atwell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28748	Sherry A. Pruitt and Ralph H. Wade v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28751	Katherine H. Miller v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28752	Kelly A. Dutil and Anthony A. Dutil v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28785	Anita Diorio v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28789	Ruth P. Jurkiewicz and Zeke M. Jurkiewicz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28790	Judith Harter and Gerald Harter v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28791	Evelyn Rugg and William Rugg v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28792	Tanika Fears v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28832	Christine King v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28851	Peggy Toftum and Adam Toftum v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:14cv28876	Amanda Holstead and Alvin Holstead, III v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02293	Irma DeBord v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02295	Teresa Durham v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02296	Dorothy Hall v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02313	Robin Molina and Paul Molina v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02316	Kimberly Poe v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson

2:16cv02325	Shirley Roberts v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02328	Phyllis Smith and Charles Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv02334	Roseann Marie Zimmerman and Kurt Zimmerman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson
2:16cv05226	Lisa Gail Grego v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson